Preface xi

1 Introduction 1
1.1 Why Another Book on Anselm’s Arguments? 1
1.2 Where is ‘Anselm’s Argument’? 4
1.3 The Two Main Divisions 7
1.4 The Layout of this Book 9

2 The Text of Proslogion 2–4 12

3 The Structure of Anselm’s Argument for the Existence of God 18
3.1 The Two Styles of Discourse 19
3.2 The Quest 21
3.3 The Formula 22
3.4 The Alleged Definition 27
3.5 The Three-Stage Structure 35
3.6 The Extended Quest 43

4 The First Stage: Being in the Understanding 45
4.1 The ‘Title’ of P2 45
4.2 The Opening Prayer 48
4.3 The Formula’s Logical Form 52
4.4 The Initial Belief 57
4.5 Translating “esse” 59
4.6 Being in the Fool’s Understanding 66
4.7 How Thought Signifies 75
4.8 The Ambiguity in Thinking of Something 82
4.9 A New Beginning 84
4.10 Being in Anselm’s Understanding 90

5 The First Stage: Being in Reality 99
5.1 Being Greater 99
5.2 Being in Reality 114
5.3 Kant’s Thesis 128
5.4 Existing Necessarily 132
5.5 An Alternative Premise 139

6 The Transition to the Second Stage: Deducing its Premise 143
6.1 Gaps in the Argument 143
6.2 Inferring Existence from Being in Reality 144
6.3 Deducing the Premise of Stage Two 147

7 The Second Stage: Existing Intensely 160
7.1 The First Premise 160
7.2 The Second Premise 167
7.3 Something whose Non-existence is Unthinkable 171
7.4 The Alleged Missing Premise 186
7.5 Intensifying Existence 195
7.6 Deducing Anselm’s Actual Conclusion 199
7.7 Universalizing the Conclusion 206
7.8 The Argument with the Alternative Premise 208

8 The Third Stage: The Existence of God 218
8.1 A Two-fold Strategy 218
8.2 The Theological Argument 220
8.3 The Metaphysical Argument 227
8.4 The Uniqueness Argument 234
8.5 The Identification of God 241
8.6 The Allegation of Begging the Question 251
8.7 The Allegation of Circularity 254
8.8 A Sceptical Hypothesis 261
8.9 The Two Interpretations 288
8.10 Existing Most Truly and Maximally 276

9 The Fool and His Defenders 281
9.1 The Two Fools 281
9.2 The Dialectical Setting 283
9.3 The Disappearance of the Fool 287
9.4 How it is Possible to Think the Unthinkable 292
9.5 Gaunilo’s Lost Island 300
9.6 ‘Tidying up’ the Lost Island 307
9.7 Comparing the Arguments 312
9.8 Sinking the Lost Island 316

10 Anselm’s Other Arguments 325
10.1 The First Leg of the Dilemma in Reply 1 325
10.2 Possibilities and Necessities 329
10.3 The Second Leg of the Dilemma in Reply 1 338
10.4 The Argument in Reply 5 342
10.5 The Argument in Reply 9 344
10.6 Anselm’s Causal Argument 357
10.7 Thinking of Something-than-which-a-greater-cannot-be-thought 367

11 The Plausibility of the Premises 370
11.1 The Plausibility of Stage One 370
11.1.1 The Concept of Being in the Understanding 370
11.1.2 The Concept of Being in Reality 373
11.1.3 Why it is Good to be in Reality 377
11.1.4 Reasoning about Properties 379
11.1.5 Being Thought to be in Reality 382
11.1.6 Assessing Stage One 383
11.2 The Plausibility of Stage Two 387
11.2.1 The Concept of Existing Intensely 387
11.2.2 Assessing Stage Two 391
11.3 The Plausibility of Stage Three 393
11.3.1 The Theological Argument 393
11.3.2 The Metaphysical Argument 394
11.3.3 Everything Other than God 395
11.3.4 Assessing Stage Three 398
11.4 Being Able to Exist or Not to Exist 399
11.5 What can be Thought 402

12 The Character of the Argument 405
12.1 Anselm’s Audience? 405
12.2 The Circle of Faith 410
12.3 What Kind of Proof? 417
12.4 Anselm’s Proof and the Ontological Argument 427
12.5 Anselm’s Cosmological Argument 435

13 The Quest Continues 448
13.1 God is ‘per se ipsum’ 448
13.2 God is the Creator and the Supreme Good 453
13.3 God is Whatever it is Better to be than Not to be 460
13.4 Some Puzzles about God’s Attributes 463
13.5 The Anguish of Anselm’s Quest 473
13.6 God is Greater than can be Thought 476
13.7 The Quest to Experience God Resumes 484
13.8 Entering into Joy 492

Appendix 499